
DURBAN – ALAC Executive Meeting and Regional Leaders Meeting with the ASO Leadership
Tuesday, July 16, 2013 – 16:00 to 17:00
ICANN – Durban, South Africa

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much. So this is the ALAC Executive Committee Meeting and Regional Leaders Meeting with ASO Leadership. Actually, initially we thought it was going to be a smaller room than this but since we have been able to keep the ALAC room we also have Members of ALAC, not only the Executive Committee, meeting. My name is Olivier Crépin-Leblond.

Welcome to all of the people who've joined us at the table. Our Agenda is rather full for the just less than one hour that we not have. We'll start with a very quick recap from the Beijing Meeting and then the main aim of this gathering is for the RALOs to identify... First perhaps to share whatever program they already have with the Regional Internet Registry, what work they have done together. And I know there have been some initiatives that have taken place, but also how to perhaps strengthen this relationship.

Then there will be a discussion about the RIR Policy Development Process – rules and recommendations on getting involved, because we know that each one of the RIRs are developing policy locally in their region. The policy for addresses has not developed at ICANN, but prior to starting I thought it would be good for our guests to quickly introduce themselves, and perhaps the Members of the RALO Leadership could

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

also. I'm not sure if you've all seen each other. We'll start with Tijani please and then we'll go in an anti-clockwise fashion.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you Olivier. My name is Tijani Ben Jemaa. I am the Vice-Chair of AFRALO.

HANS PETTER HOLEN: My name is Hans Petter Holen and I'm on the ASO Address Council, elected from the RIPE region, the RIPE NCC. I've been on the Address Council since its formation so I've been at ICANN meetings for a long time and I've been at RIPE meetings for even longer. It's also interesting for me to be here because I've just been part of setting up an ISOC Chapter in Norway. I'm not on the Board there anymore, which could potentially be an At-Large structure if we reach out to them.

I didn't really know what EURALO was before I came here today so it's been an interesting learning experience along the way as well. Thank you.

WILFRIED WOEBER: My name is Wilfred Woeber, I'm also from the RIPE region. As Hans Petter I've been in this cloud since the very beginning, since the formation of the Address Council and my primary interest is also in the vicinity of the Numbers Registry. I'm one of the Co-Chairs of what we call in our region the Database Working Group and that's the gang that tries to keep the Numbers Registry on track.

It also gets be slightly interested in this WHOIS business. Thanks and over to you.

SPEAKER: My name is [inaudible 00:06:24]. I am a Member of [inaudible 00:06:24] and I also am a Member of the ISOC Japan Chapter. Thank you.

FIONA ASONGA: My name is Fiona Asonga. I am a Member of the ASO, representing the African region and on a day-to-day I run the Telecommunication Service Providers Association of Kenya.

CARLTON SAMUELS: Hi, my name is Carlton Samuels. I am a Vice-Chair of the ALAC and in my normal day job I teach and I do consulting.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Aziz? Just one more thing, please identify the pair of headphones on your desks as here we speak French, English and Spanish. So if you're not a polyglot you might need these. Before Aziz perhaps we can start with Fatimata, who has just sat at the table?

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Fatimata Seye Sylla, Chair of AFRALO from Senegal.

AZIZ HILALI: Aziz Hilali. I am from Morocco and I'm the Secretary of AFRALO.

SPEAKER: [DEMI Danuk? 00:08:04]. [inaudible] Council Representative from the RIPE region. I just started this year. My other interests include being affiliated with the [Dutch ? 00:08:12] ccTLDs since the very beginning and I'm also a Member of ARIN – just a regular Member.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you [inaudible 00:08:22]. Paul?

PAUL WILSON: Thanks. I'm Paul Wilson, I'm from Australia, I'm the Head of APNIC, which is the IP Address Registry for the Asia Pacific. And this year I'm serving as the Chair for the Number Resource Organization, the NRO. The NRO is the collective of the five RIRs, representing the work that we do together. It covers quite a number of different, collaborative projects amongst the RIRs.

One of the collaborative projects among the RIRs is the ASO, and so the ASO is formed as an agreement between the RIRs collectively, the NRO and ICANN and I guess I won't go on with an extended run-down on that here but I'm happy to answer questions or cover aspects of that structure later if needed. Thanks.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you Paul. And strangely enough next to you is...

HOLLY RAICHE: Holly Raiche. I'm Chair of APRALO and also a Member of ALAC.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Heidi Ullrich, ICANN Staff.

JOSE ARCE: Hello, how are you all? My name is José Arce, I am from Argentina and I'm the current Chair of LACRALO.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Fantastic. [Hartment? 00:09:55]?

SPEAKER: I am an ASO Member for LACNIC. It's probably important to explain that each region has three Members; two elected by the community and one appointed by the Board of the region. So I am an appointed ASO Member by the Board of LACNIC and I'm a Board Member of LACNIC too.

GARTH BRUEN: Garth Bruen, Chair of the North American regional At-Large organization.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you Garth. Next to you?

SPEAKER: [Aksa Public? 00:10:33], Managing Director of the RIPE NCC, the area for Europe, the Middle East and parts of Central Asia.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Okay, thank you very much. And I know that at the end of the table we have Edmon Chung and is it ISOC Hong Kong that provides the Secretariat for APRALO?

EDMON CHUNG: But you just introduced me, so... This is Edmon from ISOC Hong Kong, Secretariat for APRALO.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you. I introduced you because you're so far I couldn't hear you. So just a quick recap on Beijing. Basically we had a breakfast, I believe it was, with several Members of the different RIRs and the ASO. Unfortunately several of them couldn't make it here. And we had also on our side, as in on the At-Large side, we had the Executive Committee that was there.

And one of the matters of discussion was extended or expanded collaboration between each regional At-Large organization and each regional Internet registry. Now, of course there is an understanding that the regions don't map in exactly the same way. There are some differences but some regions have done more work with their RIR, some RALOs have done more work with their RIRs than others have.

So I thought that perhaps a first step to enhance the collaboration would perhaps be to share, among the different regions, what the different RIRs have done with the different RALOs. I'm aware of several isolated cases or even more expanded cases of collaboration, but every time I come to an ICANN meeting and speak to one of the RALO Leaders they tell me of another thing that's happened.

So I'm not even aware of what's going on everywhere around the world and it would be good to see and perhaps get examples of the type of collaboration that takes place. Some regions might have done things that others have not even thought about yet. So if we start alphabetically then I can already see Tijani ready to jump forward.

AFRALO is the first region and I guess we can ask Tijani Ben Jemaa or... You work it out between yourselves. Either Tijani or Fatimata or... Okay, Fatimata Seye Sylla.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA:

I'm going to speak in French. We had an experience with our RIR very recently. It was a technical assistance that we had. A RALO needed a technical assistance and we got it in order to bring awareness and as a representative of the end users in our area, we have at heart the interest of the end users in our area, and we need to mobilize, to inform, to bring awareness of more information regarding all the ICANN issues.

Our first experience happened here and then we were able to work with AFRINIC, who supported us very well. Before that was the African Internet Summit where we were able to once again collaborate with AFRINIC once again and we were able to participate in that Summit as

AFRALO. In order to put together an AFRALO workshop, thanks to Tijani who participated in this workshop and put it together, and Mohamed was also present and did mobilize. I was not able to go on location. It was in Lusaka. AFRINIC did support us, which was very positive.

It's important to note here that we did sign a Partnership Agreement. It's not only about Durban or the African Summit. Right now we have a framework and we're going to work together in that framework. We have some needs. We are thinking about what we actually need in the future and how we can work together as a partnership to mobilize the African community to participate more in the policy debate; not only in ICANN but in AFRINIC we need more debate participation.

We are thinking about all these issues; training, IPv6 training, developing the ccTLD in Africa and other processes, other policies that we need to work on as AFRALO. This is what we did. I don't know if Tijani or Aziz want to add something? That's all I have to say.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thanks very much Fatimata. I see Tijani wanted to complete this...

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: It's not to complete. She said everything but only to say that AFRINIC was wonderful, really. They are very helpful. They proposed that we participate in the Summit and they proposed even a [telibacy? 00:16:55] port. We had a full session for us. The name was AFRALO session. It was the name of AFRALO. More than that they proposed us to participate in other panels in this Summit.

So we cannot expect more and now when we really have a need for someone who will help us to make those people come and participate in this meeting, AFRINIC was the one who helped us. So I can say that the collaboration between AFRINIC and AFRALO is 100% successful. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much Tijani. I'm not sure, do we have anyone from AFRINIC who is in the...? Fiona?

FIONA ASONGA: At least from what I know, because the way AFRINIC Staff have run everything within the region is they've tried to bring together all the relevant entities of stakeholders who would be interested in the different numbering resources. And the beautiful thing is that they have organized an AFRALO mailing list. There's an AFRALO mailing list and we get the updates of what is going on within the AFRALO community.

And AFRALO Members have been welcomed to participate in the PDP within AFRINIC, because it is open to all the community stakeholders and they are free to give their views. And even when they attended the meeting – for those who attended the meeting in Lusaka three weeks ago they were welcome to give their views on the different policies we were discussing.

Sorry, I'm going to fast. They were invited to give their views on the different policies that we were discussing and they are welcome to be part of the community and we look forward to more collaboration,

particular toward the PDP aspects of our activities, in as far as managing the numbering resources are concerned, with the AFRALO community in Africa.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much Fiona. A question for you: has the involvement of AFRALO in AFRINIC helped with the multi-stakeholder model in your region?

FIONA ASONGA: Yes, tremendously. Actually, one thing that I can point out is that because I am on a mailing list that is called AfriCANN, but it's pretty much run by the AFRALO community within Africa. Their discussions on that mailing list fed into discussions even on policy issues that we want to address within our region, and that helps us.

Personally I get a lot of input on the issues we need to look at, in terms of developing the right policies for the region. And so have all the other two ASO representatives who are with me on the ASO on behalf of AFRINIC. And we are able to discuss amongst ourselves and to figure out there is that issue on the ICANN list that needs to move into a policy discussion issue and we will talk to the Members on the policy discussion list so that we are able to get them to look at the issue and move it into a policy discussion.

And that helps us really get a lot of input in terms of relevance of what we should look at as a community.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much Fiona. I hope this is inspiring other regions. Since we do only have one hour and we could probably spend a whole day on these issues, perhaps I'll pass over to APRALO; Holly Raiche and Paul Wilson of course in that region. Holly first.

HOLLY RAICHE: We were exploring what we have done in the past but haven't done, and then exploring what we might do. Some of the things we did in the past were... Before I was a Member of ISOC .au were things like collaboration on APRICOT. Certainly I think we worked with you on IPv6 day didn't we? There were some activities. I wouldn't say it's as structured as it might be and I think probably what we will do is explore the possibilities of cooperation and listening to what everybody else does.

But I would remind you that the Pacific region goes from Armenia through China, all the way to the Pacific Islands. So to identify any particular community or any particular need is just to miss out on a lot of the regions. So to say you serve the region is actually... You need to say it's a very big and a very diverse community with a lot of different challenges in it. Thanks.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Paul?

PAUL WILSON: Yeah, it's probably worth just a few words about the Asia Pacific environment. We use the prefix AP for Asia Pacific, and APNIC is only one of a bunch of different AP organizations. So it's really quite a

diverse eco-system and we've got groups including apTLD for the top-level domains, APCERT for the certs of the regions, APIX for the Internet exchange points, apTLD of course... APAN is the regional academic and there is something called APRICOT.

That's a regional operation that happens once a year and it's our major Internet event of the region. And that meeting really is a gathering point. As Holly mentioned, it's really a gathering point for the Asia Pacific Internet community.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Could this be seen as the Asia Pacific IGF equivalent?

PAUL WILSON: Traditionally it's more technical. It's more technical an operation than policy, but there has been a slow growth so that there have been plenty of Internet governance discussions at APRICOT meetings and plenty of different meetings that happen to come together.

So what we call the APSTAR Group actually comes together and they actually come together with an APSTAR retreat for the leaders of those different groups. So in that eco-system there really is a lot of Internet governance going on. And I think the APSTAR ecosystem would really welcome APRALO and APRICOT would welcome APRALO as a regular appearance there.

I think there's a lot to be gained by bringing all of these groups together. There are practical things like fellowship programs, which bring people in. There are governmental people who will attend APRICOT and who,

by being able to dip into a bigger sampling of what's going on can really get a lot out of a visit of a few days over to the APRICOT event. So there have been some APRALO events of some kind – I think Edmon might be able to remind us.

Historically there have been some but I think it could be much more regular event in the future and I'd certainly like to see that happen. Edmon, there have been some APRALO involvement in the past, right?

EDMON CHUNG: I do remember. In fact the key meeting that created APRALO was held in conjunction with an APRICOT meeting; it just slipped my mind which one exactly but...

PAUL WILSON: It was probably Singapore many years ago, yeah.

EDMON CHUNG: Sorry?

PAUL WILSON: I said it was probably Singapore.

EDMON CHUNG: Yes. But since then... There were a number of issues, right? And when we do APRALO meetings one of the challenges of course... We talk about a face-to-face meeting at certain events and one of the challenges is always travel support for the ALSes being there. the ALSes are a little

bit more diverse than the APNIC crowd or the APRICOT crowd, which means they are not already there, which is unlike the APSTAR meetings where a lot of people are already there.

So there are some challenges but I think it's worth looking into how we can think about having these types of meetings during or in conjunction with some of the APNIC and especially APRICOT meetings.

PAUL WILSON:

I'll mention one other thing that happens around the APRICOT events: often the APNG – Asia Pacific Next Generation – youth events, and they can sometimes be a fantastic gathering of quite a few dozen young people who come together and learn a great deal from being onsite and in the [inaudible 00:27:05], so to speak.

So again, to have new people exposed to APRALO in that event would be another beneficial side effect of actually coming together. Edmon's organization, .asia, has been fantastically involved with that activity, if I can say, and it's really quite an exciting one actually.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:

Thank you very much Paul. Of course the APRALO covers Asia, Australasia and Pacific Islands as well. Is APNIC going as far as the islands as well?

PAUL WILSON:

We've got a region that was defined historically, along with our other RIR regions quite some time ago, and we go as far as South Asia,

Afghanistan to the West and through the Western Pacific Islands to the... So it doesn't exactly correspond and I guess we'll hear all about this in the ICANN Geographic Regions Working Group tomorrow. But it's quite a thing.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Yes, let's not open a discussion on that one unless you have another few hours. [laughter] Okay then, let's move on then with EURALO. We have Wolf Ludwig, who is joining us remotely. We have more than a dozen people following us remotely who weren't able to make it. But Wolf Ludwig is the Chair of EURALO. Wolf, can you hear us?

WOLF LUDWIG: Yes, I can hear you clearly.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Okay Wolf. We can hear you faintly so hopefully the technical people will be able to boost your voice a little. Please be so kind as to share your experience with any work with the RIPE equivalent in your region.

WOLF LUDWIG: Thanks a lot Olivier. So far I have to say we do not have a cooperation with RIPE entity at the EURALO level. We are always considering this as a good strategic idea or even as a sort of necessity. But it hasn't happened so far. But we do have a corporation of the regional level, it's a European dialogue on Internet governance. The RIPE entity was one of the sponsors for the last event.

And for the last EURODIG in June in Lisbon there was even some sort of enhanced cooperation with RIPE when they offered a capacity-building session for the Lisbon program and RIPE entity sponsored three participants for the new media summer school, which is organized by the European Youth Forum and it's always a traditional side event of EURODIG.

And I would like to take this cooperation between EURODIG and RIPE entity as a best practice. And in my opinion it should and could be the entry door for further cooperation between RIPE entity and EURALO. There is another good practice already and that's the cooperation between RIPE and one of our Member ALSes with medians that [inaudible 00:31:06].

But for further details on this cooperation I would like to pass this over to Sandra Hoferichter. I think she is with you in the room. She can follow up on further details for this particular cooperation and I would appreciate any further steps or outcomes from this meeting today to be followed up between Olivier and Sandra representing EURALO and [inaudible 00:31:41] for further cooperation with the RIPE entity.

And what we have got from AFRALO, to me, is a very good example of how this could also be adapted on the European level. And perhaps coming up with some sort of cooperation agreement would be a big step in the right direction. That's all for the moment. Thanks.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thanks very much Wolf. Any counterpart from RIPE, who is aware of the... Oh, perhaps Sandra, since you have been one of the key... Here we go, it's gone blank. Sandra Hoferichter?

SANDRA HOFERICHTER: Thank you Olivier. Sandra Hoferichter speaking for the record. Yes indeed I can fully support what Wolf said and can underline the support RIPE is giving to any sort of multi-stakeholder approach and capacity building in Europe for my ALS, [inaudible 00:32:47] we have been organizing, since 2007, the European Summer School on Internet Governance.

And RIPE, I think, is from the first or at least the second Summer School onwards, a sponsor. And they're not only a sponsor but they also provide a session about how the Internet is managed. So every year they send a person to give a lecture at the Summer School and the contribute money-wise as well. And this is very much appreciated.

For the cooperation on a EURALO level or an ALAC level with RIPE, I would propose that these efforts are also focused towards the development of the ICANN Academy Working Group. I know that we had Members of the ASO joining the Academy Working Group in the very early days, but nowadays there is no participation anymore, neither on the mailing list or during the face-to-face meetings we have here or at the ICANN meetings.

And I would really be happy if not only RIPE but if the ASO could re-enter the Capacity Building Working Group, because I think you are all giving great support in your regions and we are trying to achieve the same here

for ICANN. And I think that's a key element; that you are participating in this process as well. And regarding the cooperation on the regional – on the EURALO – level, I think most chances are indeed in capacity building and to bring in people from less developed regions, which we also have in Europe looking at the south-eastern Europe regions.

So it would be a great thing if RIPE could support Fellows joining multi-stakeholder events, conferences, ICANN meetings or RALO activities and the like. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much Sandra. Does anyone from RIPE wish to comment or...? Yes, go ahead please Axel.

AXEL PAWLIK: Thank you for the kind words Sandra and Wolf Ludwig. I came here and thought: "God, what are we doing with them?" And as you said, there is no high-level, direct EURALO, RIPE NCC or RIPE relationship and that should certainly be improved. But yes, we do quite a lot in the Internet governance sphere through multi-stakeholder, outreach and similar things.

Speaking of outreach – and I just had a thought here – the RIPE community has been reaching out for many years now into the regions more; out of western Europe and the recent addition beyond Russia and the Middle East, is indeed south-eastern Europe. So I'm more than happy to come and talk about some high-level MOU or whatever, on what we could do more structurally there.

We have also, in recent years, started to reach out to the academic community – basically the community we sprang from 15 or 20 years ago – and we lost them a little bit. And there is an idea of fellowship programs and things like that that we are active in, and I think that could be slightly extended to this region as well.

Speaking about the Middle East, is that then a MERALO? Or who is looking after them?

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: There isn't actually. It's APRALO who has a chunk of the Middle East, because it follows the UN regions where even Cyprus is part of Asia.

AXEL PAWLIK: We should talk to you to then. [laughs]

MATT ASHTIANI: Hi, this is Matt Ashtiani for the record. I apologize for the interruption but please remember to state your name before speaking for transcription purposes and for those following remotely.

AXEL PAWLIK: Sorry, that was me. Axel Pawlik for the record.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much Axel. Olivier speaking. Fiona?

FIONA ASONGA: Fiona Asonga, for the transcript. I have a comment on the ASO participation in the Academy Working Group. I was nominated by the ASO to be part of that, and the last I received was an email informing me that I would be added to the mailing list from Sandra Hoferichter. I can't pronounce – yes. [laughter] And there's never been any other response after that. No mailing list, no information, nothing. I'm still waiting and I'm still interested.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: There you go. So Fiona, now you see what Sandra looks like, you can go in and strangle her if you wish to but please don't actually because we do need her very much, so I'm sure she will add you to the mailing list and afterwards. Wilfried.

WILFRIED WOEBER: I'd like to follow up a little bit on the Asia Pacific report, because it occurs to me during this meeting right now that in the different regions, we seem to have slightly different approaches regarding interaction amongst each other and amongst the groups, and the thing that triggered me to ask for the microphone is that obviously in the Asia Pacific region, there is sort of integration of the security Community under the headline of APCERT.

We are in Europe having very similar infrastructure for collaboration amongst the security Teams, but this does exist not separate but in parallel to the activities of the regional numbers registry. As you can imagine, for historical reasons there is of course an overlap in people being involved in one cloud as well as in the other.

And in particular in regards to training, as this was brought up, we also, in the European region have a training program [coughs] for security people or those who want to become expert in that field.

I think it's a very good, very reasonable, very hopeful feedback from this meeting that we should think within the regions how to strengthen the interactions between those various activities and clouds, and whether this is going to be something – as Axel put it – as a formal MOU or just as another way of expressing the mutual collaboration. That's a different story, but I'm going to take that back home and also feed it back into the security community. Thanks.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Wilfried. Hans Petter?

HANS PETTER HOLEN: Trying to be concrete. Hans Petter Holen from RIPE region. There is a [Manod ? 00:40:10] meeting in Kuwait on 22nd to 23rd of September. There is an eNote meeting in Kiev on 1st to 2nd October and there is a RIPE meeting in Athens on the 14th to 18th October, so that would be excellent opportunities for the European RALOs to meet the right community and participate in the policy processes I think.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Hans Petter, and may I ask Staff, do we have a calendar that keeps track of all of these meetings? It just strikes me that we're not aware, and there are so many of these meetings taking place. I know there's a global calendar, which keeps track of the IGF and all of

the stuff, which you see in the press all the time, but these ones seem to be particularly important since they also do take place close to the location of some of our At-Large structures.

HANS PETTER HOLEN: It's all on the front page of the RIPE, so it's easy to find...

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: So I'm waiting for an answer from someone. Would it be [Gesell ? 00:41:16] I should ask the question to? Is [Gesell ? 00:41:17] online? I'm afraid we're all so scattered around the world with... [Geisel ? 00:41:23], are you able to speak? Probably not. Okay. Wilfried?

WILFRIED WOEBER: I think this idea of having some comprehensive calendar was brought up in different frameworks, and I can remember that I attended the outreach session in Beijing, and this was one of the concrete proposals that we – for any definition of we – we should try to come up with an inclusive calendar for any and all activities that we happen to know about which could be used to either inform other parties, or in that particular outreach environment, also to offer opportunities to think about co-locating activities.

If there is already something going on in a particular place, then sometimes it's easier to attach another half-a-day or two.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you. Heidi?

HEIDI ULLRICH: This is Heidi Ullrich, for the record. We do not currently have that information on our external events calendar, but if you're able to send us that, and then we could add that to the calendar.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Or send the source. It's Olivier here.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Yeah. Send the source, actually. Yeah.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Dmitri Kohmanyuk?.

DMITRI KOHMANYUK: I'd like to second the invitation to eNote meeting as I'm based in Kiev, I'll be welcome. You're all welcome, and just to add, the thing I use now, and I encourage people to use, is the PCH, the clearinghouse, they do have the PCH.net calendar, if you Google for it. It's including INOG and other meetings. We cannot see inside that.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: So for now take note please, At-Large Staff. PCH.net. Yes?

DMITRI KOHMANYUK: I can email...

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Dmitri, just email to Staff at atlarge.icann.org, and they'll be able to pick this up. I'm really mindful of the time, and I know Sala, you wanted to say a few words, but we do need to move on. We still have two regions to listen to, and we only have ten minutes. Sala?

SALA TAMANIKAIMANO: Sala Tamanikaimano for the transcripts. Just very quickly, practical ways going forward, noting that the RIRs, in this case, I suppose, the ASO – Members of the ASO – are actively involved in the different network operator Groups all around our world, and I note that it actually covers our regions with [inaudible? 00:43:50] and that sort of thing or [inaudible? 00:43:53]. One of the suggestions I'd like to make is this.

There already would be Members. There would already be people within the network operator Groups who are also Members of the accredited At-Large structures within the RALOs, so it would make complete sense – I'm not sure what the level of participation in terms of the policy processes that occur within the various RIRs are.

I'm not sure what the levels of participation is, but what we can certainly do is to find a way to coordinate between the RALOs in the RIRs on how to increase and maximize this, and I note that there will be an additional challenge for the RALOs through the ALSs to tease out and to try to not so much lure but to invite them to participate within the ALSes and that sort of thing.

If it's something that's already symbiotic to what they're already doing, and so moving forward, there's already critical mass. It's just how to expend that critical mass and make it work jointly. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Sala, and I think we're very much aware in this community that, in general, in the world, there are six degrees of separation, but in this world, it probably is less than that. Two or one, in many cases, and so, really, the purpose of this meeting here is to try and gel this into our DNA and not just rely on individuals but actually make sure that we continue, so when we'll be gone, others will be able to build on this.

We're going to move on over to the next region which is LACRALO. Latin American and Caribbean Islands Region At-Large Organization, and for this we have José Arce.

JOSE ARCE: Okay. Thank you, Olivier. I only speak in Spanish, so if you can put your headphones... Good afternoon. For the record, this is José Arce. I am the current Chair of the Latin America and the Caribbean region. I was listening to you very carefully, and I was listening to the relationship between the regions and the [rears ? 00:46:13.]

And for example, in our region, a RALO does not have a close relationship with our RIRs. For example, in the case of the African region, and this is a good thing, because we can debate and discuss and

move forward in this data action, but despite what we don't have any formal situation.

LACNIC supports our region in many ways, and I would like to tell you concrete cases emphatically without any clear agreement, LACNIC supports Organizations within our region. Within LACRALO. LACNIC people have participated in our capacity-building cycles. They have come to speak about specific policies that they discuss at an internal level, and also as Members of the NRO. Not long ago, we had [Andreas Chiesa? 00:47:15]. He was participating in this capacity-building session.

LACNIC also supports business at the local level. Last year, we had IDBC workshops developed in two provinces of Argentina delivered by people from LACNIC and organized by Organizations within our region. During this year, in August, there was an Organization from our region that is coordinating together with LACNIC and other Organizations; the pre-IGF or the regional IGF or the LACIGF.

This is very important, because it is a close relationship in terms of the specific issues. We're also working with people from LACNIC in the strategy from the Latin American Community region within ICANN. Other initiatives are, for example, that LACNIC, together with other Organizations, funds many fellowships for our Organizations to attend other events in different regions, and there is an essential point that I would like to mention.

A way to improve this relationship, apart from agreeing with some of my colleagues. We can have some agreements to institutionalize the

relationship with a RALO, so we could have certain fundraising programs that the RIR have. For example, in LACNIC, we have FREDa, so there is a program being applied by many ISOC for social development or research development in terms of lateral issues, and most of these Organizations are not part of the RALOs, and I was able to see this last year when I participated in Bogotá in the regional IGF.

Those organizations were awarded by the FREDa program, but these organizations are not part of our RALO, so I had the opportunity to invite them to be part of our RALO, so I think these programs are very important, and the RIRs could be a good collaborate with the RALOs, so I will slow down. Sorry for that. Sorry for the interpreters.

So the RIRs could collaborate by means of these programs with the RALOs so that to celebrate agreements and also deal with the associations applying for these fellowships in order to empower them and bring them to the RALOs, and we can also work with them.

I think this could be a good relationship so as to increase the knowledge of what we did in our region, so that is a summary of our relationship. I would like to highlight that LACNIC strongly supports any initiative of the Internet societies. I have mentioned some examples, but for example, nowadays, we have an event being held in the Caribbean region. There are many events in that region, and LACNIC supports different organizations not only in Latin America. That's all. Thank you very much.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, José, for this extensive list of all the activities that are taking place. I note that we have reached 17:00 hours, locally, and there is a meeting by NARALO immediately afterwards, but it falls rather well that we're now moving on to the NARALO Chair. Would we be able to have another five, ten minutes, if that's okay with everyone?

SPEAKER: NARALO yields time to ALAC. [laughter]

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: I'd hate to see the cost of that. Right. Thank you. I hope it's okay with everyone else, as well, to add another ten minutes? Okay. I see nods to that effect, so let's have NARALO Chair, Garth Bruen, please.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you. Garth Bruen, NARALO Chair. North America always last. Can we go in reverse alphabetical order sometime? Thank you. Did I miss an introduction from an ARIN representative? No? Okay. At the moment, we don't have any activities with ARIN. I think that we absolutely should. I would even recommend that we select a NARALO Member to attend ARINs public meetings. Maybe we can figure out some way to sponsor them to those meetings.

We actually have people within our region who are expert in this area. Chris Grunderman comes to mind. He's well-versed, and we'd be happy to seek out more interaction. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Garth. José Arce?

JOSE ARCE: Thanks, Olivier. José Arce speaking. I want to add something else. This is a comment regarding the relationship that the RALOs should have with the RIRs. I don't know what might be happening in other regions, but I think it would be good that if our organizations could have any kind of Membership – I don't know if that's possible, but it's just an idea – a Membership to be part of these RIRs.

If I'm not wrong, in LACNIC, there is an organization that has Membership, so if this is possible, this would be very good to strengthen the link or the relationship among our organizations and the RIRs. We're talking about a special Membership, not a regular Membership, for example, the one that a provider might have, but that would just be my simple idea.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Yeah. I wonder whether there's anyone from LACNIC who would like to comment. [Hartman? 00:54:04]

SPEAKER: For the records, my name is [Hartmun? 00:54:09] I am Board Member of LACNIC, and I am also Latin American representative in the ASO. I think that José was very extensive in the details. LACNIC is in Latin America let's say a reference to put together all the stakeholders. We have two meetings every year, and it's an open meeting with every interested party, not only the techie part, but we bring together for sure

the ISPs but all the counter codes, all the projects, as you mentioned, FREDA, and others, so we have a lot of relationships.

The big problem, I think, in Latin America, is that our Membership with LACRALO is not so strong. In some of the countries, we don't have Members. In a big country as Brazil, we have only two or three Members, so we need to have a strong outreach, and there is a request that I like to do for all of you or probably more for LACRALO to probably support any program. My understanding is that we have a lot of meetings in, let's say, academia.

We have now new ISOC Chapters, and we have a lot of open doors to have more Members joining. From our side, from LACNIC, we have full support, and I think, in August, we will have the IGF will be in Argentina and Córdoba, so we will probably have 200 people together from all parts of all constituencies, so we are working together, but there's a lot of space to do more, and LACNIC is very, very supportive. I manage the money in LACNIC.

I am the treasurer, so I know how much money we spent not for internal projects but for the community as a global outreach, so I see they are using the money, they are using the fellows, the scholarships, the open doors, the opportunities, but we can do more and more. I am finishing. At this time, we are the last [dot ? 00:56:30] in Latin America. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, [Hoffman ? 00:56:35]. It was just... Slow your speed. You speak like a Latin American. Very fast.

JOSE ARCE: You said only two or three minutes, so I need to use the time.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: I know. Hans Petter.

HANS PETTER HOLEN: Since there is nobody from ARIN here I will sort of suggest to look at ARIN website and the ARIN meeting from the 10th to 11th October in Phoenix, and that's actually back to back with a NANOG which is sort of the operators community there. So that could be a good place to meet up and get something arranged, and if you don't have contact details to ARIN Staff, I'm sure we can help out with that. So that's just a suggestion from my [section ? 00:57:13].

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, and one of the problems is – and Glenn, I haven't forgotten you; I did for a second but thanks that you put your hand back up – just mentioning the different meetings that are taking place, the community here is well aware of many meetings that take place, regionally. Unfortunately, when it asks for additional funding from ICANN, the response that has taken place for the past – I don't know how many years – was, oh, it's not an ICANN meeting.

It's not ICANN-related. Sorry, you can't go, and there was absolutely no understanding of the outreach element of such meetings. It actually went as far as the ICANN student, [Chrise ? 00:57:53], not being ICANN-

related for some reason. I'm not quite sure how – probably have to take the student, [Chrise ? 00:57:58], away and just keep ICANN to see if that's ICANN-related.

But it's been very hard for this community to attend, on their own, out of their own pocket, since most of the people in our community are volunteers who sometimes have a day job plus the volunteer position that they've taken, the At-Large structure, that they then represent at an ICANN meeting.

It's very difficult for them to both, in some cases, take the time off work, but in most cases, they can take some time off work, but they also have to pocket this out of their own pocket, so I do understand that there are some opportunities for scholarships, etc. and that would be very, very welcome indeed. Hans Petter?

HANS PETTER HOLEN:

On the same webpage, there is mention of an ARIN fellowship program so without knowing details about that, look it up there and talk to ARIN Staff.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:

Okay. Thank you. Glenn McKnight, and then we also have one last comment that's on the Adigo.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Glenn McKnight with NARALO and ISOC Canada chapter. I didn't know my friend beside me was responsible for the money for LACNIC. I guess I'll have to be friendly to him, but...

SPEAKER: You need to request this one year in advance.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Oh, okay. Okay. Now I know the rules. I guess Garth wasn't aware of it. I will be attending the ARIN in Phoenix, Arizona in October and I'm also working with ISOC Canada with a roadshow. And they did a roadshow in Québec City back in June, and we're looking at some other locations. More than likely Vancouver and Regina in this coming year.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Glenn, and over to Matt Ashtiani.

MATT ASHTIANI: This is Matt Ashtiani, for the record. This comment comes from Cheryl Langdon-Orr. Cheryl says, from the AFRALO experience, it appears that since the NIC was proactive in reaching out, there were reported successes. Perhaps the ALAC and the ASO leadership might find a way to encourage or facilitate similar high-level cooperation.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Yes. Indeed. Absolutely. I'm not going to go against that. I think we've seen the success that this has brought in this region, and I hope that this

meeting has somehow put us on that path in all the regions. We certainly have now the calendars that are going to be synchronized, and I think that we can then move forward.

We were going to have another part of this discussion talking about the policy development process, but I guess it's probably better to get to know each other first, better, and then start engaging the policy development, and as we did note this and we do know, a number of people are already taking part in the regional policy development process of the RIRs. Wilfried?

WILFRIED WOEBER:

Yeah. Just one reading from our region, from the European region. For the most recent meeting, the RIPE meeting, we had an attendance in the range of 500 people, and the statistics said that about – might want to correct me if I'm wrong – but if I remember correctly, about 50 percent of them were first-time attendees, and I think this is definitely an indication that we are not exclusively talking to the techie heads, but there is interest from other parties, from other Stakeholders, to join in, and like in our region, this may be an idea for other RIR environments.

We do not only have technical Working Groups and technical discussions, but there are also things like what we call collaboration Working Groups which just is a group that deals with interaction between this core operations group or core numbers management group and all the parties around us from government to IGFs to whatever.

That is very specific to some region or another, but I think this is also something that the At-Large Community could try to investigate in their particular region like what is already there and what can be developed further.

SPEAKER: Olivier? Here?

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: [Hautman ? 01:02:33]?

SPEAKER: I would like to request that Paul Wilson introduces German. Now we have a secretary who working full-time. Probably he can be the bridge, so please introduced him and give him some work to do. [laughter]

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you. Thank you [Hautman ? 01:02:55]. Yes. Very good Action Item to put forward with your Secretary, and I would also encourage that the different regions also get in touch with their equivalent in the RIRs, as well. Very important.

SPEAKER: So let me comply with the wishes of my stakeholder here and introduce German Valdez, who's actually employed by the NRO as the executive secretary of the Organization, so he's a person to talk to to coordinate this kind of level of interaction, so German...

GERMAN VALDEZ:

Thank you. [applause] It is my pleasure to have this position, and part of my responsibility is to help to coordinate a BLSO between the ASO and the NRO with ICANN activities and Staff, so please consider me in future endeavors for these kinds of meetings. Feel free to contact me anytime. If I may, now let's go back to the previous point. I think it's important, also, to mention some efforts that the RIR have been working and related to gender issues.

I know that APNIC and LACNIC and all RIRs during the event, they have ICT for womens' activities, so there are some aspects that have been in consideration in the RIRs, and in some cases, I remember that while the LACNIC meetings – for almost 40% of participants were women in the Venezuela meeting a few years ago – so I think the promotion of new participants are very important for the RIRs, and they are very open to embrace new people in their community.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:

Thank you very much German, and maybe one action Item would be for Staff to have your card or details and then we can proceed from there. Certainly in this community, we have some At-Large structures that deal specifically with those issues and gender balance and so on, so it's very important. Matt Ashtiani, you have the card up again for a remote participant question or comment.

MATT ASHTIANI: Hi. This is Matt Ashtiani, for the transcript record. We have a comment from Wolf Ludwig. Wolf says: “This was a promising and fruitful ALAC ASO meeting.” Thank you, and there is very much to be followed up on now.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much for this comment, Wolf, and I gather the hidden message in this is that we’ve pretty much gone full circle. Thanks to all of you for attending, and let’s hope that we can meet again in Buenos Aires, perhaps following up on the policy development, but in the meantime, there’s work to be done.

SPEAKER: You need to learn Spanish in Buenos Aires. [laughter]

SPEAKER: I just like to say, on behalf of the NRO and the ASO, thanks very much for the invitation. I think it’s been a really nice exchange, and there’s clearly plenty that we can do that will help all of us with our work, so thanks very much.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you Paul, and if I could just say [applause] one more word. It is important that we collaborate. We all are part of this ecosystem, and this ecosystem needs to remain very strong so we can work towards that end. Thank you. This meeting is now closed. [applause]

GARTH BRUEN: Garth Bruen, Chair of NARALO. We're going to take a ten-minute break before we start again. I'd like to request that Darma and the ALAC leadership from NARALO move to the front of the table and that Chris join us at the front of the table. Thank you.

SPEAKER: Thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPT]