
DURBAN – Public ICANN Board Meeting
Thursday, July 18, 2013 – 18:00 to 19:00
ICANN – Durban, South Africa

NANCY LUPIANO: Ladies and gentlemen, if you can take your seats, we'd like to start our program. Thank you.

STEVE CROCKER: Welcome, everybody. This meeting of the ICANN board is hereby in session. We will take a very brief roll call. We have everybody here, I believe.

Let me just start with you, Thomas, at that end, and just speak your name.

THOMAS NARTEN: Thomas Narten, the IETF liaison to the board for a few minutes longer.

KUO-WEI WU: Kuo-Wei Wu.

FRANCISCO DA SILVA: Francisco Da Silva.

GEORGE SADOWSKY: George Sadowsky.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

BERTRAND DE LA CHAPELLE: Bertrand de la Chapelle.

RAM MOHAN: Ram Mohan.

JUDITH VAZQUEZ: Judith Vasquez.

BRUCE TONKIN: Bruce Tonkin.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Sebastien Bachollet.

FADI CHEHADE: Fadi Chehade.

STEVE CROCKER: Steve Crocker.

CHERINE CHALABY: Cherine Chalaby.

BILL GRAHAM: Bill Graham.

GONZALO NAVARRO: Gonzalo Navarro.

HEATHER DRYDEN: Heather Dryden.

CHRIS DISSPAIN: Chris Disspain.

OLGA MADRUGA-FORTI: Olga Madruga-Forti.

ERIKA MANN: Erika Mann.

RAY PLZAK: Ray Plzak.

SUZANNE WOOLF: Suzanne Woolf.

MIKE SILBER: Mike Silber.

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you. We're going to have a slightly unusual treatment of the agenda. We very often start with a consent agenda which is a collection of resolutions that we pass all at once.

We have a consent agenda but we've embedded it in between two regular agenda items so that we can give proper attention in the proper order to these.

So the first item on the agenda is a thank you to departing community members, and we have certificates of appreciation to hand out.

We will pass the resolution and then invite the people to come up here and receive the certificates.

I understand that some are here and some are not, and we will certainly make the certificates available and get them to the other people.

So I'll just plunge right in.

Thank you to departing community members.

Whereas, ICANN wishes to acknowledge the considerable energy and skills that members of the stakeholder community bring to the ICANN process;

Whereas, in recognition of these contributions ICANN wishes to acknowledge and thank members of the community when their terms of service on supporting organizations and advisory committees end;

Whereas, the following members of the Country Code Names Supporting Organization Council are leaving their positions: Lesley Cowley as ccNSO chair, Mary Wong on the ccNSO council;

Resolved, Mary Wong and Lesley Cowley have earned the deep appreciation of the board for their terms of service, and the board wishes them well in their future endeavors within the ICANN community.

And I'll say a bit more about each person a bit later as we hand out the certificates.

Whereas, the following members of the Generic Names Supporting Organization (GNSO) are leaving their positions as their terms end: Matt Serlin, registrar stakeholder chair; Jon Nevett, new gTLD applicant group -- that's NTAG -- chair; and Alain Berranger, not-for-profit operational concerns constituency (NPOC) chair;

Resolved, Matt Serlin, Jon Nevett, Alain Berranger, have earned the deep appreciation of the board for their terms of service and the board wishes them well in their future endeavors within the ICANN community.;

And, whereas, the following members of the at-large community are leaving their terms -- their positions when their terms end: Y.J. Park, Asian, Australasian, and Pacific Islands Regional At-Large Organization (APRALO) vice chair; and Oksana Prykhodko, European Regional At-Large Organization (EURALO) secretary;

Resolved, Y.J. Park and Oksana Prykhodko have earned the deep appreciation of the board for their terms of service, and the board wishes them well in their future endeavors within the ICANN community.

I need a quick second.

Chris, thank you.

I don't know that we need any further discussion.

Let me call for --

>> (Speaker is off microphone.)

STEVE CROCKER: Yes?

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: I think we can also wish well for the future endeavors outside of ICANN, not just inside ICANN. We wish them to stay with us, but also they have other things to do in their life.

Thank you very much.

STEVE CROCKER: What a new idea.

[Laughter]

Good.

[Applause]

So that passes by acclamation.

Let me invite all of you who are here to come up to the stage -- yes, please -- and we will be slightly ceremonious about this.

[Applause]

So I need to embarrass you a bit more, so I have a few words on each of you, plus the others.

So Lesley has taken the ccNSO to the next level of excellence. She has enhanced efficiency and effectiveness in order to make it scalable but retain its original qualities of collaboration, coordination, and trust among the community members.

In the interactions with the board and ICANN, she has always reminded us, in her own graceful way, of the importance of getting strategy in place and bases of -- and bases the operation on the strategy.

We are finally entering into this mode of working.

Lesley will remain to be a member of the ccNSO council. We wish her successor, Byron Holland, all the best and we know Lesley will support him.

[Applause]

Mary Wong was appointed to the ccNSO council by ICANN's nominating committee at the Toronto meeting in October 2012. Having been previously a two-term member of the GNSO Council, she focused on efforts to increase communications and collaboration between the GNSO and ccNSO communities and on further streamlining the work of the council, serving on its triage committee.

She has also championed a greater understanding of IDNs across the ICANN community and outreach to less well represented regions, especially in Asia.

And despite Sebastien's suggestion that people have a life outside of ICANN, on July 1 she joined the ICANN policy staff, working under David

Olive, and looks forward to serving the ICANN community further in this new role.

[Applause]

Matt Serlin recently completed his service as chair of the registrar stakeholder group. He was elected to this important position in 2012 after serving as secretary and was also instrumental as the leader of the negotiation team of the 2013 registrar accreditation agreement, a major piece of work.

As an executive with MarkMonitor, Matt continues to be an important and respected contributor to ICANN's work.

Congratulations.

[Applause]

Jon Nevett has served ably the ICANN community, most recently as chair of the new gTLD applicants group. He has an extensive history of constructive contribution to ICANN policymaking, including service on the implementation recommendation team and as chair of the registrar stakeholder group.

He is the cofounder of Donuts and continues to serve our community and is a respected voice in ICANN matters.

Thank you.

[Applause]

The three people who are absent today, Y.J. Park, APRALO vice chair, ably served the ICANN community most recently as the vice chair of

APRALO, served as interim -- an interim term between 18 October 2012 and the 30th of June this year. She is a representative from Open Standards and Internet Association, OSIA.

Thank you.

[Applause]

Oksana Prykhodko, EURALO secretary, recently completed her service. She's director of the European Media Platform, a not-for-profit nongovernmental organization to promote European values and standards in the mediasphere in Ukraine. The European Media Platform is an accredited at-large structure.

Oksana was in charge of the EURALO secretariat for the past two years. We wish her the best in her future involvement.

[Applause]

Alain Berranger is outgoing chair of NPOC. He engaged at an early stage at NPOC and is very dedicated to the strengthening of NPOC as a new constituency and has always been a firm believer in NPOC's mission in representing the interests of the not-for-profit and nongovernmental organization sectors.

[Applause]

Congratulations, all. Thank you. Welcome aboard. Don't go away.

We now turn to the business that is several items on the consent agenda.

I'll turn the readings and listing of these over to Bruce.

BRUCE TONKIN:

Thank you, Steve.

So on the consent agenda today, we start with some committee appointments.

Whereas, the IETF has appointed Jonne Soininen to replace Thomas Narten as the IETF liaison to the board;

Whereas, the Board Governance Committee has recommended that the board appoint Jonne Soininen as a nonvoting liaison to each of the following committees of the ICANN board: The IANA Committee, the New gTLD Program Committee, the Public and Stakeholder Engagement Committee, and the Risk Committee;

Resolved, Jonne Soininen will replace Thomas Narten as a nonvoting liaison to the IANA Committee, the New gTLD Program Committee, the Public and Stakeholder Engagement Committee, and the Risk Committee.

The next one is a motion on the competition, consumer trust and consumer choice metrics.

Whereas, in the Affirmation of Commitments, ICANN has committed to promoting competition, consumer trust and consumer choice and to organizing a review that will examine the extent to which the introduction or expansion of gTLDs has promoted competition, consumer trust and consumer choice when new gTLDs have been in operation for one year;

Whereas, on the 10th of December, 2010 the board requested that the ALAC, the Governmental Advisory Committee, the Generic Names

Supporting Organization, and the Country Code Names Supporting Organization provide advice on establishing the definition, measures and three-year targets for competition, consumer trust and consumer choice in the context of the domain name system, which resulted in the board receiving advice this year from the GNSO Council and the ALAC, each offering recommendations on specific metrics;

It's resolved that the board thanks the GNSO Council and the ALAC for their advice letters and thanks the ICANN community for the significant efforts undertaken in response to the board's request.

It's resolved that the board directs the EEO to commence the process under the Affirmation of Commitments for convening of the competition, consumer trust and consumer choice review team for the purpose of: (i) evaluating and reporting to the board on the feasibility, utility, and cost-effectiveness of adopting the recommendations of the GNSO Council and the ALAC; (ii), evaluating other inputs, including historical data regarding metrics used to evaluate earlier rounds of new gTLDs in the year 2000 and the year 2004; (iii) engaging with the GNSO, ALAC and staff in an effort to reach agreement on the metrics; and (iv) proposing a set of metrics to be compiled by ICANN for use in the future AoC review of the new gTLD program.

It's also resolved that the board directs the president and CEO to analyze each of the proposed metrics to: (i) evaluate its feasibility and utility, (ii) evaluate and whether the implementation costs associated with its collection are reasonable in light of the value of the information to be revealed; and (iii) to provide such analysis to the review team when convened. Where the review team determines that the metrics

from the GNSO Council or the ALAC do not meet these criteria, the review team will consult with the GNSO and ALAC to share its rationale and determine whether the collective set of metrics recommended by the review team sufficiently address the goals of the GNSO and the ALAC.

The next topic is the Singapore office lease.

Whereas, ICANN has stated its objective to open and staff a hub office in Singapore;

Whereas, staff performed a thorough search to identify and evaluate locations and costs for suitable office facilities;

Whereas, on the 12th of July, 2013, the Board Finance Committee recommended that the board authorize the president and CEO to enter into, and make all necessary disbursements for, a lease for the Singapore hub office in an amount not to exceed \$750,000 for a two-year term.

Our next topic is the approval of RSSAC appointees.

Whereas, the ICANN bylaws call for the establishment of a root server system --

RAY PLZAK: Bruce, point of order. You missed the second resolution.

BRUCE TONKIN: Ah. Thank you for pointing that out.

On the top of the next page. This is the second part of the resolution as it relates to the Singapore office lease.

It's resolved that the board authorizes the president and CEO to enter into, and make all necessary disbursements for, a lease for the ICANN Singapore hub office in an amount not to exceed 750,000 for a two-year term.

Coming back now to the approval of RSSAC appointees:

Whereas, the bylaws call for the establishment of a Root Server System Advisory Council with the role to advise the ICANN community and board on matters relating to the operation, administration, security, and integrity of the Internet's root server system;

Whereas, the RSSAC is submitting this recommendation to conform with the recently adopted bylaws changes;

Whereas, the proposed participants in the RSSAC have met and agreed to the present membership and selected co-chairs;

Whereas, the bylaws call for board appointment of nominated RSSAC members and co-chairs;

It's resolved the board appoints to the RSSAC the representatives for B root server operator, Bill Manning; C root server operator, Paul Vixie; K root server operator, Daniel Karrenberg; and M root server operator, Jun Murai to the Root-Server System Advisory Committee for an initial term -- one-year term starting 1st of July 2013, with the following terms to be for three-year appointments.

It's also resolved that the board appoints to the RSSAC the representatives for A/J root server operator, Brad Verd; F root server operator, Suzanne Woolf; I root server operator, Lars Johan-Liman; and L-Root server operator, John Crain to the RSSAC for an initial two-year term starting 1st of July 2013, with the following terms to be for three-year appointments.

It's resolved the board appoints to RSSAC the representatives for D root server operator, Tim Shortall; E root server operator, David Swager; G root server operator, Jim Cassel; and H root server operator, Howard Kash to the Root Server System Advisory Committee for an initial three-year term with the following terms to be for three-year appointments.

And it's resolved the board appoints the nominated individuals, Lars Johan-Liman and Jun Murai, as the co-chairs of the RSSAC.

See how many more of these we've got to go through.

E. Budget approval timing.

Whereas, the resolutions 2013.05.18.02 and 2013.05.18.03 stated that the ICANN board intended to approve the financial year 2014 budget during the public meeting in Durban, South Africa and authorized the president and CEO to operate in a manner consistent with the draft FY 2014 budget posted for public comment, respectively;

Whereas, the public comment period for the draft FY 2014 budget closed on the 20th of June 2013;

Whereas, changes to the draft FY 2014 budget posted for public comments have been identified subject to posting;

Whereas, the ICANN board sought comments on such changes during the public meeting in Durban, South Africa, and wishes to be able to review such comments prior to approving the financial year 2014 budget;

Whereas, the Board Finance Committee has recommended that the board pass the two resolutions below.

And the resolutions are:

The board intends to approve the financial 2014 budget after the Durban meeting and by no later than end of August 2013.

It's also resolved for the period of time beginning on 1st of July 2013 through the date that the board approves the financial 2014 budget, the board directs the president and CEO to operate ICANN in a manner consistent with the draft financial year 2014 budget that was posted for public comment.

Finally, we move on to a couple of thank you resolutions.

Okay. Thank you to sponsors of the Durban meeting.

The board wishes to thank the following sponsors: Afilias Limited.org, the Public Interest Registry, Community .Asia, Iron Mountain, NeuStar Incorporated., UniForum SA Central Registry, Freedom Registry, PDR Solutions, NCC Group, Radix, Clearinghouse, VeriSign, CentralNIC, Africa.com, .CLUB Domains, and our local sponsors, Neotel and MTN. And ICANNWiki.

And finally, we wish to thank interpreter staff and event teams at the Durban meeting. The board expresses its appreciation to the scribes,

interpreters, technical teams, and the entire ICANN staff for their efforts in facilitating the smooth operation of the meeting.

The board also would like to thank the management and staff of the Durban International Convention Center for the wonderful facility to hold this event.

Special thanks are given to Lee-Ann Dahl, senior sales and events coordinator, the Durban International Convention Center, and Debbie de Villiers, director, Terra Nova, for their support.

And finally, we wish to thank the local hosts of the Durban meeting.

The board wishes to extend its thanks to the local host organizer, ZADNA, for their support. Special thanks are given to Dr. Hasmukh Gajjar, chairman; Mr. Lucky Masilela, director and chairman of the ICANN 47 local host working group; Mr. Vika Mpisane --

MIKE SILBER: Bruce, I'll take the resolution as the local.

BRUCE TONKIN: What was that?

MIKE SILBER: I say I'll take the resolution as the local.

BRUCE TONKIN: That would be very helpful. Thank you, Mike.

MIKE SILBER:

The board wishes to extend its thanks to the local host organizer, ZADNA, for their support. Special thanks are given to Dr. Hasmukh Gajjar, chairman; Mr. Lucky Masilela, director and chairman of the ICANN 47 local host working group; Mr. Vika Mpisane, general manager; Mr. Neil Dundas, CEO of the ZACR; Ms. Simla Budhu, head of policy of the ZACR; and the ZADNA-ZACR ICANN 47 local host working group members. Thanks are also given to Mr. Ndabo Khoza, CEO of KZN tourism; Ms. Sonto Mayise, KZN Convention Bureau; Mr. Jim Patterson, director; Ms. Palesa Banda, Internet security director; Mr. Ishmael Malebye, deputy director at the South African Department of Communications.

The board also thanks Dr. Gajjar; Dr. Elham Ibrahim, Commissioner, Infrastructure and Energy, African Union Commission; Mr. Lukonga Lindunda, cofounder and director of BongoHive; Dr. Nii Narku Quaynor; and Dr. Hamadoun Toure, Secretary-General, International Telecommunications Union, for their participation at the meeting.

STEVE CROCKER:

And not printed on your copy, the board also thanks its own Mike Silber.

[Laughter]

[Applause]

That's the full consent agenda. Yeah. Call for a second.

Sebastien. Excellent. Thank you.

All in favor?

[Affirmative responses]

Any opposed?

[Silence]

Any abstentions?

[Silence]

The full consent agenda is passed. I think we want to make a comment or two.

Bruce?

BRUCE TONKIN:

Yeah. I just want to make one comment. I want to answer the question that Jonathan Zuck posed in the public forum on the consumer metrics.

The resolution, as you note, is to actually form the review team for the Affirmation of Commitment review and to look at those metrics.

Your question was that, you know, we should collect -- start collecting some of those metrics now. The comment I would make is that the GNSO and the ALAC provided a comprehensive list of metrics. Some are easier to collect than others, and in fact, even in the GNSO paper, it refers to some of the metrics as being, you know, moderately difficult to obtain.

So I think probably the outcome of that, Jonathan, would be the straightforward metrics like, you know, number of registrar breach notices, the performance parameters that the registries provide, all that

can be starting to get collected now, but some of the bigger pieces of work need a bit more analysis before commencing.

So hopefully that answers your question.

STEVE CROCKER: Sebastien?

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Yeah. I just want to add that it's not because ICANN has request to have some -- to gather some data that other parts of the community are not available or can't do also some data collection.

I think that there are registries, registrars who can do some data collection who can be used by the community and be useful. Don't just wait for ICANN to do everything.

And my last point is I hope that for everybody collecting data, they will do that in an open manner and that everybody in the community will be able to use this data to analyze what they would like to analyze.

Thank you very much.

FADI CHEHADE: Yeah, I would like to also thank -- in addition to everything that was said here, I want to really publicly thank all the team and board members of ZADNA. You cannot imagine the amount of work and coordination these people have done to make our meeting go smoothly. It's really remarkable.

[Applause]

Superb, available any time we had concerns, issues. Immediately available. Top-level people. Everybody got on the phone, work with us. And I'm sure you will agree with me that a bit of the African spirit, a bit of the Madiba spirit, something was different at this meeting. Many people commented on the smoothness of the meeting, the level of tranquility that, despite some of the newcomers not thinking, so this is quite tranquil by normal standards. It was a very good meeting. I want to thank ZADNA on the record and hope that we get a chance to work with them again sometime in the future.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER:

Yeah. I, too, had the pleasure of meeting the leaders. Really solid people. Just really first-class people to enjoy working with no matter how knotty the problems are. I want to step back just a second and point out that here we have three resolutions, taken individually by themselves, look sort of focused and narrow. But they actually have connections in very big ways to the transitions that are taking place in ICANN. The consumer -- the competition consumer choice -- consumer trust and choice metrics is the fourth of the Affirmation of Commitments reviews. It was scheduled to come after we had the gTLD program under way. So that's a significant milestone and connected, as I said, to a bigger strategy that has been under way.

The Singapore office lease, similarly, although it's a specific action very narrowly focused, is part of the major transformation of the headquarters operation of ICANN and is a big step forward.

And the approval of the RSSAC appointees is part of a rebirth of RSSAC, much stronger engagement. Quite a lot of work has been going on inside of RSSAC. This set of appointments is the beginning of sort of the first tranche.

I want to thank Suzanne for a huge amount of work in shepherding this. Lots of communication and lots of coordination back and forth. And, Suzanne, I suspect you'd like to add something to this.

SUZANNE WOOLF:

I guess as a technologist, I'm sort of about efficiency. But thank you for that. And I do want to say it's important to us, has been for a while, to sort of start over with RSSAC as more of a part of a larger community as part of a advisory committee to the board and the staff and the larger community. I had the great pleasure of having our new chair -- one of our new cochairs this week, Lars-Johan Liman. He got to meet a lot of people that he hadn't met before, at least not in this new role. It was I think very, very positive of us. And, like this initial appointment of our bootstrapping our initial group of members, I think we're really on a different and better path with the community here.

There's still a great deal of work to be done just as far as operating procedures and inviting liaisons and expanding membership and all the things we have to do as an advisory committee. That's truly a part of

the community. But I'm looking forward to doing that work and to your help. Thank you.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER:

We move back to the main agenda. I want to make a comment about the way we've divided up the work. About a year ago, I had the intention of putting as little as possible on the public agenda and getting sort of regular work out of the way in the closed board meeting with the idea of just being efficient.

The feedback was pretty negative about that. Shifted to putting as much as possible on the public agenda. There isn't very much. But what we have is here. And putting only what's necessary on a private board meeting. We had a private board meeting, closed board meeting yesterday. And the only items that were there are related to things that needed to be kept in confidence for one reason or another. They either involved personnel actions or contract negotiations.

And one particular group, which is why I want to make mention of it, is - - we have a process for IANA operation, for IANA transactions, delegations and redelegations, where the details are disclosed when the delegation or the redelegation is in effect, which takes a little while after the resolution is passed and as it goes through the rest of the steps. Not a very long time, but it takes a little while.

And so there are full resolutions and rationale and a bit more information than we have typically provided in the rationale portion in

the past, although, essentially, equivalent to what's passed on the IANA sites.

So yesterday we passed resolutions for the redelegation of Indonesian and Acetonia dot IE and dot EE domains. And the delegation of the IDN for Mongolia, dot mon in Cyrillic, I believe. Is that right? Yeah. And so those are done. And the only reason, as I say, that they're not in this session is because, in putting forth the full amount of information that we feel is appropriate to publish as part of this, there's a confidentiality for a short period of time.

This brings us to the last piece of regularly scheduled business. Sad, but necessary.

This is the time at which we thank Thomas. And it will no longer be a few minutes; but it's almost here, Thomas. So I will read -- if I can shuffle papers fast enough.

And then don't go away. We have a few more things to burden you with.

Whereas, Thomas Narten was appointed to serve as the IETF liaison to the board to the ICANN board in March 2004. 9 years? Wow.

Whereas, Thomas has served as the IETF liaison each year since March 2004.

Whereas, Thomas concludes his term on the ICANN board on 18 July 2013, this very day. Whereas, Thomas has served as a member of the following committees and working groups: Public and Stakeholder Engagement Committee, formerly Public Participation Committee, IANA

Committee, Board IDN Variants Working Group, New gTLD Program Committee, Technical Relations Working Group, Working Group on Equivalent Strings Support, President's IANA Consultation Committee, Risk Committee, and possibly a few that we have forgotten.

Resolved: Thomas Narten has earned the deep appreciation of the board for his term of service. And the board wishes him well in his future endeavors both within and without the ICANN community.

[Applause]

I'm going to dispense with the formalities. This passed by acclamation. But I have a little more to do.

THOMAS NARTEN: Could I make a friendly amendment? Is that allowed?

STEVE CROCKER: Depends how friendly, yes.

THOMAS NARTEN: It seems like I've been here nine years, but it's actually only eight years.

STEVE CROCKER: Where is the error here? 2005?

THOMAS NARTEN: 2005 Luxembourg, which I believe was in July.

STEVE CROCKER: I see. We will amend it.

THOMAS NARTEN: Thank you.

STEVE CROCKER: Eight years still feels like a long time.

Yeah. We know.

We have just a few words that need to be said in addition. So hang on here. We're just going to start with Ram and then Suz. And then we'll continue from there.

RAM MOHAN: Thank you, Steve. As the IETF liaison appointed by the Internet Architecture Board, Thomas Narten held a dual set of responsibilities -- on the one hand to the ICANN community and to the ICANN board where Thomas played a critical function in ensuring that the IETF and the technical communities issues, concerns, and fears were accurately relayed to the board and addressed in a timely and complete manner. On the other hand, Thomas also played a crucial role to ensure that the decisions and deliberations that happened in the ICANN community were explained to the technical community, many of whom do not participate in ICANN and really don't fully understand why we need so much time to discuss and decide on matters that, to an engineer, are not only blindingly obvious but ought to have been solved a long time ago probably by designing an algorithm or creating a new protocol.

But it became quickly clear to all of us on the board that Thomas was more than just a technical liaison helping us navigate tricky technical topics, although we, certainly, came to depend upon him for that talent. Thomas quickly distinguished himself as one of the fearless ones, bringing up topics that were often important but not urgent, topics that, if left alone, could have quickly escalated into urgent issues that would have required firefighting on all of our behalves. We can recall the many, many times where, Thomas, you saved us from going down what seemed like an endless loop of discussion or where you provided analysis that clearly differentiated a momentous issue from a trivial one.

Thomas, we'll miss your clear-eyed thinking, your pragmatic guidance while we're making decisions. And we'll certainly miss your technical expertise and attention to detail. Big thanks to IAB for sending someone of this caliber and ability to serve on this board. Jonne, you have big shoes to fill. And, Thomas, personally, it's been an absolute privilege to work closely with you. And I wish you all the best.

[Applause]

SUZANNE WOOLF:

I can't remember the last time I got to speak twice in one board meeting. This is great.

It is hard to know what to say to my friend. He's about doing the work with competence and integrity, not about credit, not about talking a lot about it. I do welcome the chance to try to say something about what that means to this community. I've been very privileged. I've been learning since from Thomas since a long time ago. I'm not quite sure

either of us wants to remember quite how long. First in the IETF. He knows his stuff. He has time for people who want to learn. I've learned a great deal purely about technology from him and working with him on the board. I've also been able to learn a great deal from him about how to get technology consideration and technology issues a proper place in what goes on here in deliberations here. Not dominating and not fading into the woodwork, but one of the things that belongs in kind of the rough and tumble of what we do here and making good policy and good decisions.

There's a lot more I could say, but I don't think Thomas needs another memory of a board meeting as the last thing between him and a well-deserved evening off. So I'll just say I continue to have the privilege, I hope, of working with Thomas in the IETF and also, I hope, in this community. Thank you. It's always a privilege, sir.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER: Bruce.

BRUCE TONKIN: Thank you, Steve. I think others have certainly commented on Thomas' strong technical skills. And, certainly, he's actively participated in all the technical working groups that the board has been engaged in. But I think it's also worth noting that Thomas has been a keen observer of the dynamics between the interactions between the board, the staff, and the community. He's often sitting in the room. He's one of the board members that attends as many sessions as he can. He'll sit silently. But

often he'll come back after that session and actually come back to the board and say, you know, really, we need to improve.

So I think Thomas brings the values from the IETF community. And those values include always trying to seek rough consensus and also having a clear process to reach that consensus.

One of the things he focuses on the board is asking the board to be clear to the community on how we're going to treat a particular topic, what we're going to actually seek comments on, and actually explain how we've addressed each of the comments that we have received. So in many ways Thomas has been the champion for what we call in this community accountability and transparency. But in other communities we would call it, basically, efficient and effective process. So I'd really like to commend Thomas.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER: Cherine.

CHERINE CHALABY: Just a word or two to say thank you, I think, on all of my colleagues on the new gTLD committee.

You have helped tremendously. You always acted with a lot of integrity and openness and true support. Just one word "a true gentleman." And thank you so much, Thomas, for everything you've done. A true gentleman. Thank you.

[Applause.]

STEVE CROCKER: Let me ask you to come up on stage with me. Hang on just a second. Just a second. We've got steps here to go.

>> Move to the lectern.

STEVE CROCKER: It might be easier, yeah. There's microphones on here, right?

So I'm going to read something, but it's not mine. We have a voice from the recent past here. Rita is apologetic that she couldn't be here with us. How many -- it's a question of how fast we forget. How many remember Rita? It's hard to forget.

First thing about Tom I think of is sweetheart, a gentleman and wonderfully kind individual. I could always count on him no matter where we were to take a walk and chill out, even during the most stressful deliberations. His great nature is paralleled only by his extensive knowledge of technology and, of course, the Internet infrastructure. We would be in heavy debates about incredibly detailed technical points often with people saying things that were inaccurate. I could always go to Tom for specific and comprehensible answers to my granular questions. He's not a techie who speaks in garbled code or overgeneralizations. He's an approachable, knowledgeable, veritable expert in a field that can be diluted with egos without substance. Furthest thing from Thomas. He's an excellent board liaison in his own

right getting passionate on issues when needed and never one to avoid asking the tough questions himself. He's been an incredible asset to the board during his eight years of service. I think he's slightly insane for staying that long, but it demonstrates his commitment to this incredibly important global asset. He'll be missed, and he'll leave behind large running shoes to fill.

THOMAS NARTEN: Thank you, Steve.

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you.

[Applause]

So we have the certificate of appreciation and one more -- good. In order to make it awkward to carry home, we've gotten something big and heavy for you.

THOMAS NARTEN: Ah, it's nice.

STEVE CROCKER: It is nice.

THOMAS NARTEN: An ICANN globe.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you, Steve. Go ahead. It's your speech.

THOMAS NARTEN: Well, it's not going to be very much of a speech.

I guess I've been doing this for, I guess, eight years, which I counted up is 25 meetings plus all the workshops and so forth. So that's quite an experience. But then I look back. And there are many people out in the community that have been doing this much longer than I have that go all the way back to the beginning. And so I have a lot of, you know, really great experiences, met a lot of really great people. And all I can really say is thank the community, because this is such a great community here. And by "community," I mean, really, everyone here. I mean the board, just the individuals on the board. I also mean staff. And I really do mean that. And especially the volunteers here. And all I can really say is it's been a real pleasure and honor to be able to be a participant here and to serve the community. So thanks.

[Applause]

STEVE CROCKER: Thank you. One small thing. As you step down, let me ask Jonne to come and present yourself to the audience. I know you won't be hard to see. Take Thomas' seat. And so we welcome Jonne. Jonne has been here before in another capacity, and many of us have known him for several years. And he's a real pleasure to work with.

And I'm obliged to ask if there's any other business, but I don't have to take a pause before I say we're adjourned. There's a party next door down in 4AB. Come and join us for drinks. No?

[Applause]

NANCY LUPIANO: The party is right out the door straight ahead in the foyer in the front of the building.

STEVE CROCKER: Aha. Thank you. So my notes were wrong. Thank you.

[Applause]

[END OF AUDIO]